Module MAU23203: Analysis in Several Real Variables

Michaelmas Term 2020

Section 10: Second Order Partial Derivatives and the Hessian Matrix

D. R. Wilkins

Copyright © Trinity College Dublin 2020

Contents

10 Second Order Partial Derivatives and the Hessian Matrix	94
10.1 Second Order Partial Derivatives	94
10.2 Local Maxima and Minima	97

10 Second Order Partial Derivatives and the Hessian Matrix

10.1 Second Order Partial Derivatives

Let X be an open subset of \mathbb{R}^n and let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a real-valued function on X. We consider the second order partial derivatives of the function f defined by

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \, \partial x_j} = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \left(\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_j} \right).$$

We shall show that if the partial derivatives

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}$$
, $\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_j}$, $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j}$ and $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_j \partial x_i}$

all exist and are continuous then

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \, \partial x_j} = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_j \, \partial x_i}.$$

Now it would be incorrect to assert that if the second order partial derivatives of a real-valued function f of real variables x_1, x_2, \ldots, x_n all exist at some point of the domain of the function then

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \, \partial x_j}$$
 and $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_j \, \partial x_i}$.

are equal for all values of i and j. A standard counterexample is provided by the function $f: \mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathbb{R}$ that is defined so that

$$f(x,y) = \begin{cases} \frac{xy(x^2 - y^2)}{x^2 + y^2} & \text{if } (x,y) \neq (0,0); \\ 0 & \text{if } (x,y) = (0,0). \end{cases}$$

Calculations applying the basic definitions and the standard rules of differential calculus show that the second order partial derivatives of this function f at every point of its domain \mathbb{R}^2 . However the second order partial derivatives are not continuous at the point (0,0), and moreover

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \, \partial y} = 1$$
 and $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \, \partial x} = -1$.

Theorem 10.1 Let X be an open set in \mathbb{R}^2 and let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a real-valued function on X. Suppose that the partial derivatives

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x}$$
, $\frac{\partial f}{\partial y}$ and $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y}$

exist and are continuous throughout X. Then the partial derivative

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial u \partial x}$$

exists and is continuous on X, and

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x}.$$

Proof Let

$$f_x(x,y) = \frac{\partial f}{\partial x}, \quad f_y(x,y) = \frac{\partial f}{\partial y},$$

$$f_{xy}(x,y) = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} \text{ and } f_{yx}(x,y) = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x}$$

and let (a, b) be a point of X. The set X is open in \mathbb{R}^2 and therefore there exists some positive real number L such that $(a + h, b + k) \in X$ for all $(h, k) \in \mathbb{R}^2$ satisfying |h| < L and |k| < L.

Let

$$S(h,k) = f(a+h,b+k) + f(a,b) - f(a+h,b) - f(a,b+k)$$

for all real numbers h and k satisfying |h| < L and |k| < L. First consider h to be fixed, where |h| < L, and let $q: (b-L, b+L) \to \mathbb{R}$ be defined so that q(t) = f(a+h,t) - f(a,t) for all real numbers t satisfying b-L < t < b+L. Then S(h,k) = q(b+k) - q(b). It then follows from the Mean Value Theorem (Theorem 7.5) that there exists some real number v lying between b and b+k for which q(b+k) - q(b) = kq'(v). But $q'(v) = f_y(a+h,v) - f_y(a,v)$. It follows that

$$S(h,k) = k(f_y(a+h,v) - f_y(a,v)).$$

The Mean Value Theorem can now be applied to the function sending real numbers s in the interval (a - L, a + L) to $f_y(s, v)$ to deduce the existence of a real number u lying between a and a + h for which

$$S(h,k) = k(f_y(a+h,v) - f_y(a,v))$$

$$= hkf_{xy}(u,v)$$

$$= hk \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y}\Big|_{(x,y)=(u,v)}.$$

Now let some positive real number ε be given. The function f_{xy} is continuous. Therefore there exists some real number δ satisfying $0 < \delta < L$ such that $|f_{xy}(a+h,b+k) - f_{xy}(a,b)| \le \varepsilon$ whenever $|h| < \delta$ and $|k| < \delta$. It follows that

 $\left| \frac{S(h,k)}{hk} - f_{xy}(a,b) \right| \le \varepsilon$

for all real numbers h and k satisfying $0 < |h| < \delta$ and $0 < |k| < \delta$. Now

$$\lim_{h \to 0} \frac{S(h,k)}{hk} = \frac{1}{k} \lim_{h \to 0} \frac{f(a+h,b+k) - f(a,b+k)}{h}$$
$$-\frac{1}{k} \lim_{h \to 0} \frac{f(a+h,b) - f(a,b)}{h}$$
$$= \frac{f_x(a,b+k) - f_x(a,b)}{k}.$$

It follows that

$$\left| \frac{f_x(a, b+k) - f_x(a, b)}{k} - f_{xy}(a, b) \right| \le \varepsilon$$

whenever $0 < |k| < \delta$.

Thus the difference quotient $\frac{f_x(a,b+k)-f_x(a,b)}{k}$ tends to $f_{xy}(a,b)$ as k tends to zero, and therefore the second order partial derivative f_{yx} exists at the point (a,b) and

$$f_{yx}(a,b) = \lim_{k \to 0} \frac{f_x(a,b+k) - f_x(a,b)}{k} = f_{xy}(a,b),$$

as required.

Corollary 10.2 Let X be an open set in \mathbb{R}^n and let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a real-valued function on X. Suppose that the partial derivatives

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}$$
 and $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j}$

exist and are continuous on X for all integers i and j between 1 and n. Then

$$\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_j \partial x_i}$$

for all integers i and j between 1 and n.

10.2 Local Maxima and Minima

Definition A function $\varphi: X \to \mathbb{R}^p$, defined over an open set X in \mathbb{R}^n and mapping that open set into \mathbb{R}^p for some positive integers n and p, is said to be k times continuously differentiable if the partial derivatives of the components of the functions φ of all orders less than or equal to k exist and are continuous throughout the domain X of the function φ .

Let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over some open subset X of \mathbb{R}^n . (In other words, let f be a real-valued function defined on an open set X in \mathbb{R}^n whose first and second order partial derivatives exist and are continuous throughout the domain X of the function f.) Suppose that f has a local minimum at some point \mathbf{p} of X, where $\mathbf{p} = (p_1, p_2, \dots, p_n)$. Now for each integer i between 1 and n the map

$$t \mapsto f(p_1, \dots, p_{i-1}, t, p_{i+1}, \dots, p_n)$$

has a local minimum at $t = p_i$. It follows that the derivative of this map vanishes there. Thus if f has a local minimum at \mathbf{p} then

$$\left. \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i} \right|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p}} = 0.$$

In many situations the values of the second order partial derivatives of a twice continuously differentiable function of several real variables at a stationary point determines the qualitative behaviour of the function around that stationary point, in particular ensuring, in some situations, that the stationary point is a local minimum or a local maximum.

Proposition 10.3 Let f be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over an open ball in \mathbb{R}^n of radius δ centred on some point \mathbf{p} of \mathbb{R}^n . Then, given any vector \mathbf{h} in \mathbb{R}^n satisfying $|\mathbf{h}| < \delta$, there exists some real number θ satisfying $0 < \theta < 1$ for which

$$f(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{h}) = f(\mathbf{p}) + \sum_{k=1}^{n} h_k \left. \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_k} \right|_{\mathbf{p}} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k=1}^{n} h_j h_k \left. \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} \right|_{\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}}.$$

Proof Let **h** satisfy $|\mathbf{h}| < \delta$, and let $q(t) = f(\mathbf{p} + t\mathbf{h})$ for all real numbers t in some appropriately chosen open interval in the real line that contains the real numbers 0 and 1. The function q is the composition function in which the function f follows the function that sends real numbers t in the domain

of q to the point $\mathbf{p} + t\mathbf{h}$ of \mathbb{R}^n . It follows, on applying the Chain Rule for differentiable functions of several real variables (Theorem 8.20) that

$$q'(t) = \sum_{k=1}^{n} h_k(\partial_k f)(\mathbf{p} + t\mathbf{h})$$

and

$$q''(t) = \sum_{j,k=1}^{n} h_j h_k(\partial_j \partial_k f)(\mathbf{p} + t\mathbf{h}),$$

where

$$(\partial_j f)(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) = \frac{\partial f(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)}{\partial x_j}$$

and

$$(\partial_j \partial_k f)(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) = \frac{\partial^2 f(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)}{\partial x_j \partial x_k}.$$

Now

$$q(1) = q(0) + q'(0) + \frac{1}{2}q''(\theta)$$

for some real number θ satisfying $0 < \theta < 1$. (see Proposition 7.10). Consequently

$$f(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{h}) = f(\mathbf{p}) + \sum_{k=1}^{n} h_k (\partial_k f)(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k=1}^{n} h_j h_k (\partial_j \partial_k f)(\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h})$$
$$= f(\mathbf{p}) + \sum_{k=1}^{n} h_k \left. \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_k} \right|_{\mathbf{p}} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k=1}^{n} h_j h_k \left. \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} \right|_{\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}},$$

as required.

Let f be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over an open ball of radius δ about some given point \mathbf{p} of \mathbb{R}^n . It follows from Proposition 10.3 that if

$$\left. \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_j} \right|_{\mathbf{p}} = 0$$

for $j=1,2,\ldots,n,$ and if $|\mathbf{h}|<\delta$ then there exists some real number θ satisfying $0<\theta<1$ for which

$$f(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{h}) = f(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} h_i h_j \left. \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} \right|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}}.$$

Let f be a real-valued function defined over an open set in \mathbb{R}^n whose second order partial derivative are defined at a point \mathbf{p} of its domain. Let us denote by $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}))$ the *Hessian matrix* at the point \mathbf{p} , defined by

$$H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}) = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} \bigg|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p}}.$$

Suppose now that the function f is twice continuously differentiable on its domain. Then $H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}) = H_{j,i}(\mathbf{p})$ for all integers i and j between 1 and n, by Corollary 10.2, and thus the Hessian matrix is symmetric.

We now recall some facts concerning symmetric matrices.

Let $(c_{i,j})$ be a symmetric $n \times n$ matrix.

The matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is said to be *positive semi-definite* if $\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j \geq 0$ for all $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$.

The matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is said to be *positive definite* if $\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j > 0$ for all non-zero $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$.

The matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is said to be negative semi-definite if $\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j \leq 0$ for all $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$.

The matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is said to be negative definite if $\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j < 0$ for all non-zero $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$.

The matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is said to be *indefinite* if it is neither positive semi-definite nor negative semi-definite.

Lemma 10.4 Let $(c_{i,j})$ be a positive definite symmetric $n \times n$ matrix. Then there exists some positive real number ε that is small enough to ensure that any symmetric $n \times n$ matrix $(b_{i,j})$ whose components all satisfy the inequality $|b_{i,j} - c_{i,j}| < \varepsilon$ is positive definite.

Proof Let S^{n-1} be the unit (n-1)-sphere in \mathbb{R}^n defined by

$$S^{n-1} = \{ (h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n : h_1^2 + h_2^2 + \dots + h_n^2 = 1 \}.$$

Observe that a symmetric $n \times n$ matrix $(b_{i,j})$ is positive definite if and only if

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} b_{i,j} h_i h_j > 0$$

for all $(h_1, h_2, ..., h_n) \in S^{n-1}$. Now the matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is positive definite, by assumption. Therefore

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j > 0$$

for all $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in S^{n-1}$.

But S^{n-1} is a closed bounded set in \mathbb{R}^n , it therefore follows from Theorem 6.3 that there exists some $(k_1, k_2, \ldots, k_n) \in S^{n-1}$ with the property that

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j \ge \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} k_i k_j$$

for all $(h_1, h_2, ..., h_n) \in S^{n-1}$. Let

$$A = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} k_i k_j.$$

Then A > 0 and

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j \ge A$$

for all $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in S^{n-1}$. Set $\varepsilon = A/n^2$.

If $(b_{i,j})$ is a symmetric $n \times n$ matrix all of whose coefficients satisfy the inequality $|b_{i,j} - c_{i,j}| < \varepsilon$ then

$$\left| \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} (b_{i,j} - c_{i,j}) h_i h_j \right| < \varepsilon n^2 = A,$$

for all $(h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n) \in S^{n-1}$, hence

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} b_{i,j} h_i h_j > \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i,j} h_i h_j - A \ge 0$$

for all $(h_1, h_2, ..., h_n) \in S^{n-1}$. Thus the matrix $(b_{i,j})$ is positive definite, as required.

Using the fact that a symmetric $n \times n$ matrix $(c_{i,j})$ is negative definite if and only if the matrix $(-c_{i,j})$ is positive definite, we see that if $(c_{i,j})$ is a negative definite matrix then there exists some $\varepsilon > 0$ with the following property: if all of the components of a symmetric $n \times n$ matrix $(b_{i,j})$ satisfy the inequality $|b_{i,j} - c_{i,j}| < \varepsilon$ then the matrix $(b_{i,j})$ is negative definite.

Let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over some open set X in \mathbb{R}^n , and let \mathbf{p} be a point of the open set X. We have already observed that if the function f has a local maximum or a local minimum at \mathbf{p} then

$$\left. \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i} \right|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p}} = 0 \qquad (i = 1, 2, \dots, n).$$

We now study the behaviour of the function f around a point \mathbf{p} at which the first order partial derivatives vanish. We consider the Hessian matrix $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}))$ defined by

$$H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}) = \left. \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} \right|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p}}.$$

Lemma 10.5 Let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over an open set X in \mathbb{R}^n , and let \mathbf{p} be a point of the open set X at which

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}\Big|_{\mathbf{x}=\mathbf{p}} = 0 \qquad (i = 1, 2, \dots, n).$$

If f has a local minimum at the point **p** then the Hessian matrix $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}))$ at **p** is positive semi-definite.

Proof The first order partial derivatives of f are zero at \mathbf{p} . It follows that, given any vector $\mathbf{h} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ which is sufficiently close to $\mathbf{0}$, there exists some θ satisfying $0 < \theta < 1$ (where θ depends on \mathbf{h}) such that

$$f(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{h}) = f(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} h_i h_j H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}),$$

where

$$H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}) = \left. \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} \right|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}}$$

(see Proposition 10.3).

It follows from this result that

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} h_i h_j H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}) = \lim_{t \to 0} \frac{2(f(\mathbf{p} + t\mathbf{h}) - f(\mathbf{p}))}{t^2} \ge 0.$$

The result follows.

Let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over some open set in \mathbb{R}^n , and let \mathbf{p} be a point of the domain of f at which the first order partial derivatives of f are zero. The above lemma shows that if the function f has a local minimum at \mathbf{p} then the Hessian matrix of f is positive semi-definite at \mathbf{p} . However the fact that the Hessian matrix of f is positive semi-definite at \mathbf{p} is not sufficient to ensure that f is has a local minimum at \mathbf{p} , as the following example shows.

Example Consider the function $f: \mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathbb{R}$ defined by $f(x,y) = x^2 - y^3$. The first order partial derivatives of f are zero at (0,0). The Hessian matrix of f at (0,0) is the matrix

$$\left(\begin{array}{cc} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{array}\right).$$

This matrix is positive semi-definite. However (0,0) is not a local minimum of f because f(0,y) < f(0,0) for all y > 0.

The following theorem shows that if the Hessian matrix of the function f is positive definite at a point at which the first order partial derivatives of f vanish then f has a local minimum at that point.

Theorem 10.6 Let $f: X \to \mathbb{R}$ be a twice continuously differentiable real-valued function defined over some open set X in \mathbb{R}^n , and let \mathbf{p} be a point of X at which

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}\Big|_{\mathbf{x}=\mathbf{p}} = 0 \qquad (i = 1, 2, \dots, n).$$

Suppose that the Hessian matrix $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}))$ of the function f at the point \mathbf{p} is positive definite. Then f has a local minimum at \mathbf{p} .

Proof The first order partial derivatives of f take the value zero at \mathbf{p} . It follows that, given any vector \mathbf{h} in \mathbb{R}^n which is sufficiently close to $\mathbf{0}$, there exists some θ satisfying $0 < \theta < 1$ (where θ depends on \mathbf{h}) such that

$$f(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{h}) = f(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} h_i h_j H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}),$$

where

$$H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}) = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_i \partial x_j} \Big|_{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}}$$

(see Proposition 10.3). Suppose that the Hessian matrix $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p}))$ is positive definite. Then there exists some positive real number ε small enough to

ensure that if $|H_{i,j}(\mathbf{x}) - H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p})| < \varepsilon$ for all i and j then $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{x}))$ is positive definite (see Lemma 10.4).

But it follows from the continuity of the second order partial derivatives of f that there exists some positive real number δ small enough to ensure that $\mathbf{x} \in X$ and $|H_{i,j}(\mathbf{x}) - H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p})| < \varepsilon$ for all integers i and j between 1 and n whenever $|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{p}| < \delta$. Thus if $|\mathbf{h}| < \delta$ then $(H_{i,j}(\mathbf{p} + \theta \mathbf{h}))$ is positive definite for all $\theta \in (0,1)$ so that $f(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{h}) > f(\mathbf{p})$. Thus \mathbf{p} is a local minimum of the function f.

A symmetric $n \times n$ matrix C is positive definite if and only if all its eigenvalues are strictly positive. In particular if n=2 and if λ_1 and λ_2 are the eigenvalues of a symmetric 2×2 matrix C, then

$$\lambda_1 + \lambda_2 = \operatorname{trace} C, \qquad \lambda_1 \lambda_2 = \det C.$$

Thus a symmetric 2×2 matrix C is positive definite if and only if its trace and determinant are both positive.

Example Consider the function $f: \mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathbb{R}$ defined by

$$f(x,y) = 4x^2 + 3y^2 - 2xy - x^3 - x^2y - y^3.$$

Now

$$\left. \frac{\partial f(x,y)}{\partial x} \right|_{(x,y)=(0,0)} = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad \left. \frac{\partial f(x,y)}{\partial y} \right|_{(x,y)=(0,0)} = 0.$$

The Hessian matrix of f at (0,0) is

$$\left(\begin{array}{cc} 8 & -2 \\ -2 & 6 \end{array}\right).$$

The trace and determinant of this matrix are 14 and 44 respectively. Hence this matrix is positive definite. We conclude from Theorem 10.6 that the function f has a local minimum at (0,0).